

PUBLIC

DERBYSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**APPOINTMENTS AND CONDITIONS OF SERVICE
COMMITTEE**

24 June 2019

**Report of the Executive Director for Children's Services
and
Director of Organisation Development and Policy**

**APPLICATION FOR THE PAYMENT OF A MARKET SUPPLEMENT TO
CHILDREN'S SERVICES CHILD PROTECTION SOCIAL WORKERS**

1. Purpose of the Report

For the Committee to approve the application to pay a Market Supplement to Children's Services Child Protection Social Workers.

2. Background Information

Children's Child Protection Social Workers (including Starting Point) are critical posts within the Council providing core statutory functions in relation to child in need, child protection and children in care.

In 2018 the Council agreed a 'growth bid' which enabled children's services to increase the number of Child Protection Social Workers in front line children's teams. The aim of this was to strengthen our ability to achieve best outcomes for children by introducing a new social work team structure and reduced caseloads for staff.

Since the implementation of the growth bid the actual number of established Social Workers in post has increased but not enough to embed the revised team structure as comprehensively or as consistently as required. As a result agency social workers have been increasingly relied upon to increase case allocation capacity and support the new team structures.

There is a business imperative to recruit and retain social workers due to the statutory duty to protect children and the high level of regulation through OFSTED inspection of children's services; the inspection regime provides a clear rationale to ensure that 'good' outcomes are achieved for children and child protection services are adequately supported to do so by the Council. Leadership and management in the Council is an area OFSTED consider in 'grading' a Local Authority.

Social workers have told us that the package of support Derbyshire offers is very good and important to them; but for some social workers the differential in the pay scales to other neighbouring LA's has tipped the balance and they are prepared to take a risk

and work elsewhere. It is expected that by improving our reward offering coupled with refining the understanding of the support package that we will attract and retain more social workers in Derbyshire.

Section 4 and 5 of the attached Application for the Payment of a Market Supplement sets out the annual turnover rate across the workforce which has increased since 30 April 2017 – 11.5% to 30 April 2019 – 18.6%. Vacancy levels are 89.06fte (including Starting Point) at 30 April 2019, compared to 28.19fte (excluding Starting Point) at 30 April 2018 and 24.92fte (excluding Starting Point) at 30 April 2017, with the increase in 2019 being due to the Growth Bid introduction in September 2018. Agency staff currently fill 65.5fte of the 89.06fte vacancies leaving net unfilled vacancies at 23.56fte.

While the numbers of starters has increased from 31.2fte in the 12 month period to 30 April 2017 to 49.3fte in the 12 month period to 30 April 2019, this increase has not been fast enough to meet the increasing turnover demands and fill the additional 70fte vacancies introduced by the Growth bid in 2018.

Section 7 of the attached Application for the Payment of a Market Supplement sets out a comparison table of salary levels across the region.

A Child Protection Social Worker Workforce Strategy is also being finalised which sets additional actions to improve recruitment and retention in the profession. This strategy addresses the following priorities and is supported by an Action Plan for 2019 and 2020:

- Recruitment
- Reward
- Social Worker Caseloads
- Continuous Improvement
- Career Development

3. Summary of proposals

Section 8 of the attached Application for the Payment of a Market Supplement proposes the following market supplements be paid.

1. To pay a Market Supplement to Children's Services Child Protection Social Workers at the following rates:
 - Grade 9 - £4,000pa
 - Grade 10 - £3,000pa
 - Grade 11 – £2,000pa
2. To pay Grade 12 Practice Supervisors a minimum of point 29 (£37,344) of the Grade 12 (points 28 – 31 pay scale) in order to ensure that all Practice Supervisors are paid more than a Grade 11 Social Worker.

If approved by the Appointments and Conditions of Service Committee then the proposals would be actioned with effect from 1 July 2019 for a period of two years, with a further review of market conditions taking place towards the end of the two year period when the new structure has been stabilised.

Consideration has been given to alternatives to paying a market supplement but have been discounted, e.g. recruitment and retention payments.

4. Legal Considerations

There is currently a clear difficulty in recruiting to social work posts which is partly evidenced in the number of vacancies. There is a tension between the level of payment required to recruit employees to these roles and the maintenance of the Council's pay and grading structure based upon the Hay job evaluation scheme.

The Council needs to ensure that the payment of a market supplement to this group of workers does not expose it to potential equal pay claims. The payment of a market supplement to this group of workers could result in a difference in the pay of men and women who are carrying out work which has been rated as equal value under the Hay scheme.

The Council will have a defence against an equal pay claim if it can be shown that the difference in pay can be explained by a 'material factor' that does not involve direct or unjustified indirect sex discrimination; for example, in this case it would appear that the payment is necessary to enable the Council to carry out its statutory duties in relation to child protection and children in care.

Market supplements should be time limited and subject to review to ensure that, at all times, it can be shown the market forces relied on remain the reason for any pay differential. Typically in local government, the standard period for a review is up to 2 years, subject to a review after 12 months. An advantage of reviewing payments periodically is that they are easier to justify by way of a link with current market conditions. Time limiting the payments in this manner would assist in guarding against an equal pay challenge made on the basis that the payment was no longer justified. If challenged the Council would need to satisfy a tribunal that any market supplement reflected a genuine need to pay an increased rate to solve a temporary recruitment problem and that problem was continuing thereby justifying the continuing enhanced rate of pay.

Therefore, on balance, it would be justifiable for the supplement to be paid. However, the payment of a market supplement should only be a temporary solution to facilitate a wider strategy to support recruitment and retention in this area.

5. Financial Considerations

The attached Application for the Payment of a Market Supplement has potential cost impacts outlined in Section 8.

Potentially the market supplement payments (including the additional Payments to Grade 12s) could raise annualised costs to £1,068,766 above budget. However, this needs to be considered against the current annualised overspend position of £983,624 above budget i.e. £85,142 more.

To ensure that expenditure is contained within the current allocated budget, a vacancy level of 27.75 fte Social Worker posts would be required maintaining this is not anticipated to significantly affect the trajectory of performance over the two years since some level of vacancy is always experienced. This will be closely monitored through budget monitoring by SMT, vacancy control and performance analysis.

6. Legal and Human Rights Considerations

Any final proposals will need to comply fully with the Council's statutory and contractual duties.

7. Other Considerations

In preparing this report the relevance of the following factors has been considered: prevention of crime & disorder, equality of opportunity, environmental, health, property, social value and transport considerations.

8. Executive Director's and Director's Recommendation

1. That the Committee approve the payment of the Market Supplement for a period of two years.

**Jane Parfrement
Executive Director for Children's Services**

**Emma Crapper
Director of Organisation Development and Policy**

APPLICATION FOR THE PAYMENT OF A MARKET SUPPLEMENT

POST TITLE: Childrens Social Workers

GRADE: 9-11

SALARY: £25,064 - £35,187 per annum (2019-20 pay rates)

**AREA/DIVISION: Childrens Services Child Protection Social Workers
Grades 9, 10, 11. (Plus resultant consequential point uplift for Grade 12
Practice Supervisors)**

DEPARTMENT: Children's Services Department

NEW SUPPLEMENT (DELETE AS APPLICABLE)

Is this application to:

Assist recruitment to a vacant post(s) - yes

To retain existing employees – yes

Information and analysis

1. Outline why this post is essential to the Council.

Children's Child Protection Social Workers (including Starting Point) are critical posts within the Council providing core statutory functions in relation to child protection and children in care.

In 2018 the Council agreed a 'growth bid' which enabled children's services to increase the number of Social Workers in front line children's teams. The aim of this was to strengthen our ability to achieve best outcomes for children by introducing a new social work team structure and reduced caseloads for staff.

Since the implementation of the growth bid the actual number of established Social Workers in post has increased but not enough to embed the revised team structure as comprehensively or as consistently as required. As a result agency social workers have been increasingly relied upon to support the new team structures.

There is a business imperative due to the statutory duty to protect children and the high level of regulation through OFSTED inspection of children's services; the inspection regime provides a clear rationale to ensure that 'good' outcomes are achieved for children and child protection services are adequately supported to do so by the council. Leadership and management in the Council is an area OFSTED consider in 'grading' a Local Authority.

2. Please provide evidence that consideration has been given to the use of agency workers, contractors, private sector or other providers to undertake the work. This should include advantages and disadvantages.

Childrens Services currently has approximately 60fte agency staff in place and is spending on average £71k per week on agency staffing. On average a 1fte agency Social Worker is approximately £26,000pa more expensive than an employed Social Worker.

Additionally, the use of Agency staff can have an impact on the quality of work through inconsistency of practice. Agency staff are able to leave at short notice causing disruption to the support for children and their families and additional work for employed colleagues to quickly pick up the case work. In addition, managers have duplication of effort in recruitment, reallocation and risk management, liaising with agencies and managing the lack of continuity in casework.

Consideration of alternatives to market supplement payments were made and subsequently discounted eg retention payments. The market supplement is envisaged as a tool to meet both current retention and recruitment challenges. At the end of the two year period, once the structure has stabilised, a review to consider the ongoing use of retention payments would take place.

3. Please provide evidence that consideration has been given to redesigning the job/structure to undertake the work in a different way

In 2018 analysis of the changes in social work practice and required support to children and families for the future was undertaken and resulted in the Council agreeing a 'growth bid' to enable the remodelling of Childrens Social Work services to create smaller teams supported by new Practice Supervisors and additional social workers to sustain reduced, manageable caseloads. The current difficulty in recruitment and retention of social workers may mean that these important changes could be in jeopardy should Derbyshire County Council be unable to recruit and retain sufficient numbers of Social Workers, particularly in Amber Valley, Erewash, South Derbyshire and South Dales and North East and Bolsover.

Managing complex child protection case work takes time and reflective considered practice. Social Workers need manageable caseloads to be able to provide a good standard of safe practice which leads to better outcomes for children compared to practice performed by Social Workers with large caseloads who are overloaded and more likely to miss crucial indicators of abuse or neglect.

In order to 'grow' the number of social workers various routes into Social Work are being supported in Derbyshire:

- Frontline (partnership arrangement with Government commissioned organisation);
- Grow Your Own (a route for existing staff to become Social Workers delivered in partnership with Nottinghamshire City Council and Manchester Metropolitan University);
- Step up to Social Work (Government Scheme which is a full time study programme, existing staff can be supported by providing extended unpaid leave to train to become a Social Worker, scheme is also open to external applicants) ;

- Return to Social Work Practice (National initiative to encourage professionals to return to practice).

Work is also under way to procure a provider for 14 Social Work Apprenticeships across the 7 locality teams.

The culmination of these schemes will provide additional qualified social workers in Derbyshire, but there is a time lag of between 6 months and 4 years before workers qualify from the different schemes.

A Social Worker Recruitment and Retention working group was established in 2017 to consider all the issues in relation to growing the social work workforce. Over the last 3 years the differential between Derbyshire pay rates for social workers and those of other Local Authorities has become more apparent. Social workers require a good deal of support to ensure they are able to practice effectively and manage the resulting stress from child protection work. This being the case pay is not the only factor which motivates social workers to work in a particular Local Authority and Derbyshire is recognised for its effective support package, however there is a risk to Derbyshire that if salaries remain at the current levels, which are significantly lower than neighbouring authorities individuals who have been supported to train as a Social Workers will leave to work outside of Derbyshire County Council. Derbyshire has already begun to see this trend developing with more social workers choosing to leave for a higher salary offer.

Roles within the Council are evaluated using the Hay job evaluation scheme which ensures a rank order that provides protection against equal pay claims. Job evaluation roles restricts the Council's ability to be able to adjust grades on the basis of market need, thus the application for a Children's Services Child Protection Social Worker market supplement.

4 & 5. Turnover rates and evidence from exit interview

There are particularly significant challenges recruiting and retaining social workers across Derbyshire in child protection teams (particularly Amber Valley, Erewash, South Derbyshire and South Dales and North East and Bolsover) as shown by the vacancy rates and agency figures as at the end of April 2019:

Children's Services Child Protections Social Worker Establishment (Grade 9-11) Vacancies and Annual Turnover Rate as at 30 April 2019												
Locality/ Service	Current Establishment* (Pre Growth Bid 2017)	Vacancies	Vacancy rate	Agency (within vacancies)	Agency Workers as % of SW WF (within vacancy rate)	Annual Turnover Rate – Permanent Workforce						
						Turnover Rate as at 30/04/19	Starters in year to 30/04/19	Turnover Rate as at 30/04/18	Starters in year to 30/04/18	Turnover Rate as at 30/04/17	Starters in year to 30/04/17	
High Peak (HP)	39.2 (27.8)	2.0	5.10%	3.0	7.65%	33.3%	8.7	13.5%	8	15.9%	6.1	
Chesterfield (CHE)	42.6 (32.1)	4.5	10.56%	0.0	0.00%	8.30%	9.0	13.2%	9.0	15.1%	2.6	
NE/Bolsover (NE/B)	50.2 (39.3)	22.36	44.54%	13.0	25.90%	42.4%	12.0	7.0%	9.0	8.3%	6.6	
Amber Valley (AV)	34 (25.5)	14.9	43.82%	11.0	32.35%	15.8%	7.0	57.9%	6.0	18.8%	5.5	
Erewash (ERE)	37 (28.5)	19.6	52.97%	16.6	44.86%	20.0%	4.1	26.3%	4.0	16.7%	3.0	
South Derbyshire (SD)	34.7 (23.5)	19.1	55.04%	13.9	40.06%	21.4%	5.0	8.0%	2.0	10.7%	5.6	
Disability Services (DS)	22.5 (13.5)	4.6	20.44%	6.0	26.67%	0.0%	3.5	5.9%	1.0	6.5%	2.0	
Starting Point	8.1 (n/a)	2.0	24.70%	2.0	24.70%	7.70%	0.0	25%	1.0	0.0%	0.0	
Total	268.3 (198.3)	89.06	32.15%	65.5	25.27%	18.6%	49.3	19.6%	38.4	11.5%	31.2	

*the establishment does not differentiate by Grade (9,10,11)

The annual turnover rate across Children's Services workforce has increased since 30 April 2017 – 11.5% to 30 April 2019 – 18.6%. Vacancy levels are 89.06fte (including starting point) at 30 April 2019, compared to 28.19fte (excluding starting point) at 30 April 2018 and 24.92fte (excluding starting point) at 30 April 2017, with the increase in 2019 being due to the Growth Bid introduction in September 2018. Agency staff currently fill 65.5fte of the 89.06fte vacancies leaving net unfilled vacancies at 23.56fte.

While the numbers of starters in the Children's Service's workforce has increased from 31.2fte in the 12 month period to 30 April 2017 to 49.3fte in the 12 month period to 30 April 2019, this increase has not been fast enough to meet the increasing turnover demands and fill the additional 70fte vacancies introduced by the Growth bid in 2018.

The table below shows comparative data from Adult Care

Adult Care Social Worker Headcount (Grade 9-11) Vacancies and Annual Turnover Rate as at 30 April 2019											
Locality/ Service	Current Establishment	Vacancies	Vacancy rate	Agency (within vacancies)	Agency Workers as % of SW Wf (within vacancy rate)	Annual Turnover Rate – Permanent Workforce					
						Turnover Rate as at 30/04/19	Starters in year to 30/04/19	Turnover Rate as at 30/04/18	Starters in year to 30/04/18	Turnover Rate as at 30/04/17	Starters in year to 30/04/17
High Peak (HP)	20.93	1.00	4.77%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	4.03	n/a	2.85	n/a	1.80
Chesterfield (CHE)	22.42	2.90	12.93%	5.0	22.30%	n/a	4.00	n/a	6.00	n/a	1.80
NE/Bolsover (NE/B)	41.43	3.31	7.98%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	7.80	n/a	11.80	n/a	4.50
Amber Valley (AV)	21.78	3.50	16.07%	3.0	13.77%	n/a	5.60	n/a	5.80	n/a	-
Erewash (ERE)	26.52	6.00	22.62%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	7.09	n/a	6.09	n/a	3.50
South Derbyshire (SD)	23.19	3.90	16.81%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	5.80	n/a	5.20	n/a	4.80
Mental Health	42.55	2.09	4.91%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	16.09	n/a	10.20	n/a	5.00
Hospitals	15.60	2.00	12.82%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	5.00	n/a	2.00	n/a	1.00
Direct Care	2.00	0.50	25.00%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	1.50	n/a	-	n/a	-
Prevention	5.00	1.00	20.00%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	2.00	n/a	1.00	n/a	2.00
Learning Disability and Deaf Services	11.30	3.50	30.97%	0.0	0.0%	n/a	3.00	n/a	0.50	n/a	3.00
Total	232.72	29.7	12.7%	8.0	3.3%	7.8%	61.91	12.0%	51.44	5.8%	27.40

It can be seen from comparing Children's Service's data with Adult Care that at 30 April:

- The vacancy rate of Children's Services was 32.15% while Adult Services was 12.7%.
- The turnover rate of Children's Services was 18.6% on an establishment of 268.3fte while Adult Services was 7.8% on an establishment of 232.72fte.
- Children's Services utilised 65.5fte agency workers while Adult Services utilised 8fte agency workers.
- Children's Services highest vacancies occurred in North East Derbyshire and Bolsover (22.36fte) while Adults Services highest vacancies occurred in Erewash (6ffte)

Staff Stability

	Child Protection Social Workers		Adult Care Social Workers	
Period of Employment as SW at DCC	Percentage of workforce	Cumulative Percentage of the workforce	Percentage of workforce	Cumulative Percentage of the workforce
Up to 1 year	30.9%	30.9%	27.0%	27.0%
1 to 2 years	21.4%	52.3%	24.0%	51.0%
2 to 4 years	21.3%	73.6%	18.0%	69.0%
4 to 6 years	9.1%	82.7%	8.0%	77.0%
6 to 10 years	5.0%	87.7%	9.0%	86.0%
10 to 15 years	9.6%	97.3%	9.0%	95.0%
15 to 20 years	2.1%	99.4%	3.0%	98.0%
20 to 25 years	0.6%	100.0%	1.0%	99.0%
25 years+	0.0%	0.0%	1.0%	100.0%
Total	100.0%.	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

It can be seen that in Children's Services 30.9% of the workforce have less than 1 years' service, 52.3% of the workforce have less than 2 years' service, and that 73.6% of the workforce have less than 4 years' service.

As this particular workforce is highly skilled and regulated increasing workforce stability should benefit of the outcomes of children's casework as having one continuous social worker dealing with a case from start to finish is generally beneficial.

Feedback from exit interviews and new social workers demonstrates that the relatively low pay level in Derbyshire is currently the biggest barrier to retention and recruitment to the vacant roles within the establishment. Many social workers leave following obtaining a role and completing less than 4 years' service.

A secondary retention issue is the pressure on the workforce in operating with large vacancies within the teams which is causing upward pressure on caseload levels.

6. Number and quality of responses to job advertisements

Since the Council's online Recruit system went live in August 2018, 24 Child Protection Social Worker adverts have been placed, resulting in 213 applications. The response rate to adverts has been varied, ranging between 0 and 26 per advert, with an average of 9 applications per advert.

Some (approximately 4) Social Workers who have been offered roles have subsequently turned down the offer as they have secured higher paid jobs elsewhere.

7. Verification of pay or terms and conditions differential between the Council and the market

	Salary Range: Grade 9 (Level 1)	Salary Range: Grade 10 (Level 2)	Salary Range: Grade 11 (Level 3)	Retention or other Pay Schemes (if applicable)	Non-pay initiatives
Derbyshire County Council	£26,890	£27,914- £30,980 (accelerated pay progression £29,957)	£32,032- £35,187 (accelerated pay progression £33,084)	Accelerated pay progression (Locality & Disability Teams)	
Derby City Council	£32,233 - £36,153	£37,107 - £39,961			
Nottinghamshire County Council	£26,999 - £31,371	£31,371 - £35,934		Retention payments in targeted hard to retain teams (excl. NQSW): £1K after 6 months £1K after 1 year £3 after 2 years £4K after 3 years	mobile working; transfer scheme; CPD package; options to enhance pay by becoming a Practice Educator/ASYE Mentor
Nottingham City Council	£25,295 - £26,999	£28,785 - £30,507	£32,878 - £34,788	Market Supplements: Up to £1,633-£1,963 (for L2 & L3 respectively)	
Leicestershire County Council	£26,397	£27,387 - £30,762	£34,599 - £37,107	Market Supplements paid – no details	
Sheffield City Council (top of grades)	£33,799	£33,799	£37,849		
Rotherham Metropolitan Borough Council	£29,909	£33,136	£37,107		
Comparators top of the scale Mean	£30,771	£32,780	£37,124		
Difference - DCC top salary and Comparator Mean	-£3,881	-£1,800	-£1,937		

For DCC Grade 10 and Grade 11 Social Workers it can be seen that Derby City Council, Nottingham County Council, Leicestershire County Council, Sheffield City and Rotherham Metropolitan Borough Council have higher starting or top end salaries. As these employers surround Derbyshire and are within an easy commute the impact of these salary levels means that potential Social Work candidates and existing staff are migrating to these employers.

8. Amount of market supplement to be paid

Please note that all supplements are quoted as gross payments and that tax, and national insurance deductions would be made. The supplements are pensionable.

Market supplements paid to Child Protection Grade 9, 10 and 11 Social Workers (and consequential point uplift for Grade 12 Practice Supervisors)

It is proposed to make the following market supplement payments (and consequential point uplift for Grade 12 Practice Supervisors) for a period of two years with effect from 1 July 2019:

- Child Protection Grade 9 - £4,000 based upon comparison to the comparator's mean
 - Child Protection Grade 10 - £3,000 based upon comparison to the comparator's mean but also particularly taking account of Rotherham and Sheffield's pay scales.
 - Child Protection Grade 11 - £2,000 based upon comparison to the comparator's mean
- and to
- Pay all grade 12 Practice Supervisors at minimum of point 29 (£37,344pa) to ensure that there is a small differential between Social Workers at the top of grade 11 with market supplement (£37,187pa) and Practice Supervisors at point 29.

The proposal to pay above the average mean difference at Grade 10 is due to a) the current low numbers of Grade 10s generally across the County, b) the impact that other LA's particularly Rotherham and Sheffield have had on turnover in North East and Bolsover, and c) that the rate of loss of Grade 10's is greater than in other grades. Derbyshire have invested in training social workers at the start of their career only to lose them at a point when child protection cases can be allocated in light of their experience level.

These payments would be per 1fte and paid pro-rata for any part-time (and relief staff).

Table showing impact at each salary pay point:

Existing Salary Scales (2019-20)			Market Supplement Amount *	Total with Market Supplements
Grade 9	16	£25,064	No longer used for frontline child protection Social Workers	
	17	£25,673		
	18	£26,282		
	19	£26,890	£4,000	£30,890
Grade 10	20	(£27,914)	n/a	n/a
	21	(£28,935)	n/a	n/a
	22	£29,957	£3,000	£32,957
	23	£30,980	£3,000	£33,980
Grade 11	24	£32,032	n/a	n/a
	25	£33,084	£2,000	£35,084
	26	£34,135	£2,000	£36,135
	27	£35,187	£2,000	£37,187
	28	£36,266	n/a	

Grade 12	29	£37,344	n/a	Propose to use pt 29 as a minimum salary for Practice Supervisors in frontline Child Protection teams
	30	£38,424	n/a	
	31	£39,503	n/a	

*Market Supplements are all pro-rated for part-time staff

Current Cost Estimate

Current costs	£m
Grade 9 - 61.03fte @ £26,890	1.641
Grade 10 - 38.95fte @ £30,980	1.207
Grade 11 – 79.27fte @ £35,187	2.789
Total	5.637
On Costs (24.33%)	1.371
Annualised Total	7.008
65.5fte agency workers @ (annualised cost £65,797) *	4.310
Annualised Total of existing model	11.318

* This is £1.724m more than is budgeted, for this number of Social Workers.

The current budget allocation for Child Protection Social Workers & Starting Point Social workers including on costs at 24.33% is £10.335m. The current estimated spend as detailed above of £11.318m would exceed this budget by £0.983m over a 12 month period. This is not sustainable financially and is part of the reason for the proposed market supplements, set out below.

Costs of Proposed Supplements

Grade	Market Supplement
Existing Roles	£m
Grade 9 Market Supplement Payments 61.03fte @ £4,000	0.244
Grade 10 Market Supplement Payments 38.95fte @ £3,000	0.117
Grade 11 Market Supplement Payments 79.27fte @ £2,000	0.159
Grade 12: Increase salaries for 20.5fte on pay point 28 to pay point 29 @ cost of £1,078	0.022
Total	0.542
Vacant Roles (89.06fte SW)	
Grade 9 (assume 40fte @ £4,000)	0.160
Grade 10 (assume at 22fte @ £3,000)	0.066
Grade 11 (assume 27.06fte @ £2,000)	0.054
Vacant Roles (3.5fte PS)	
Grade 12 (3.5fte @ increased cost of £1,078)	0.004
Total	0.284
Total Cost excluding on costs	0.826
On Costs at 24.33%	0.201
Total Cost	1.027

Estimated costs of full establishment (268.31fte)

	£m
current salaries	
Grade 9: 101.03fte @£26,890	2.717
Grade 10: 60.95te @ £30,980	1.888
Grade 11: 106.33fte@ £35,187	3.741
Total	8.346
On Cost (24.33%)	2.031
Total of the establishment without market supplements	10.377
Total Cost of full establishment including supplements	11.404

The establishment as set out above along with the estimated cost of the proposed market supplement would take the total estimated spend to £11.404m, £1.069m over the current budget. However this assumes a 0% vacancy rate which is highly unlikely in the current environment and has never previously been achieved in Derbyshire or nationally.

To ensure that expenditure is contained within the current allocated budget, a vacancy level of 27.75 fte Social Worker posts would be required maintaining this is not anticipated to significantly affect the trajectory of performance over the two years since some level of vacancy is always experienced. This will be closely monitored through budget monitoring by SMT, vacancy control and performance analysis.

This would still require all agency staff to be replaced by DCC employed Social Workers, which would also provide a stable workforce and better outcomes for children.

9. Likely effectiveness of market supplement

The market supplement will ensure Social Worker pay is closer to the local comparators mean average.

Partnership working with other local authorities across the region has taken place to cap the rate at which agency workers are paid.

The Council currently has 89.06fte Social Worker vacancies in Child Protection and Starting Point combined. This level of vacancies has been generally constant since the Growth Bid structure took effect in September 2018.

The comparison with other local Social Work salary levels shows that Derbyshire County Council has relatively lower salary levels. In addition, feedback from Social Workers who leave Derbyshire County Council suggests that a large proportion do so to earn more money with other employers.

This market supplement is likely to be effective in helping recruit to vacancies and retain existing Social Workers.

10. Analysis of the likely impact of market supplement

The purpose of this market supplement is to increase the level of pay of Child Protection Social Workers at Grade 9, 10 and 11 in order to recruit to the 87.06fte vacancies and retain existing staff, so that the overall workforce profile moves closer to the Social Worker establishment

required, thus reducing the current agency spend and ensuring better outcomes for the children of Derbyshire.

In terms of impact on other employees:

Social Workers not working in Child Protection in Childrens Services – Childrens' Services has other Social Workers not working in Child Protection eg working in Fostering and Adoption. Generally, fostering and adoption work is seen as less emotionally demanding than Child Protection work. This means that a number of Social Workers have a preference for working in Adoption and Fostering over Child Protection work. However, the introduction of this supplement could mean that those non-Child Protection Social Workers wish to transfer to Child Protection roles. If this did prove to be the case then recruitment into Fostering and Adoption roles is easier than into Child Protection roles and it is not envisaged that securing replacement adoption and fostering social workers will be a difficulty.

Social Workers at Grade 9, 10 and 11 in Adult Care – these employees work to the same Job Profile as Children's Services Social Workers and have the same job Grades ie Grade 9, 10 and 11. Adult Care have categories of Social Workers who are likely to respond to changes to remuneration such as this and therefore need to be included in any considerations.

Other roles at Grade 9, 10 and 11 across the Council – All jobs at these grades have been rated through job evaluation as equivalent and therefore any additional payments to one particular group could lead to challenge. The Council has a low pay line and increasing the whole pay line is not affordable and would impact the whole pay structure and not just be isolated to these grades. Any risk is reduced if the Council can clearly evidence the rationale for introducing a market supplement.

Practice Supervisors at Grade 12 in Children's Services – This market supplement is an interim measure to meet the immediate market challenges of Social Worker Recruitment and Retention. A payment of £2,000 will mean that a Social Worker at the top of Grade 11 could receive total payments of £37,187pa which would be the equivalent of between point 28 (the lowest point) and point 29 in the Grade 12 salary scale. In order to address this issue, it is proposed that grade 12 Social Workers currently on the lowest point are increased to the next point on the scale to ensure a differential. This will result in only a marginal difference in salary between Social Workers on the top of grade 11 and Practice Supervisors and will therefore require sensitive communication to Practice Supervisors.

This market supplement does not address the underlying low pay line issue but does seek to increase their pay in line with the employment market conditions for Children Protection Social Workers to increase the capability of DCC to recruit and retain them which is considered a legitimate business need.

11. Legal Considerations

This additional payment is proposed for a predominantly female group of employees and so may give rise to equal pay concerns. The need to pay the market supplement should be balanced against the difficulties in recruiting to these roles and the need for the Council to meet its statutory obligations to provide this service. Therefore, on balance, it would be reasonable for the supplement to be paid to support the recruitment process.

Children's Services Child Protection Social Workers Workforce Strategy 2019 - 2020

The Purpose of the Strategy

The purpose of the strategy is to set out Derbyshire's approach to recruiting and retaining Children's Services Child Protection Social Workers.

Our employee value proposition for Social Workers includes:

- A great professional training and development offering
- Supportive team-working approach
- Competitive pay levels
- Practice Supervisors to coach on professional practice
- Working with an appropriately size and manageable caseload
- A career progression route
- Support with HCPC registration
- Flexitime working
- Free parking, Cycle to Work scheme

The strategy has been developed under the leadership of Children Services Senior Management Team.

The strategy seeks to ensure a fully resourced, sustainable, and highly qualified Child Protection workforce. The national challenge in recruiting and retaining qualified and experienced Child Protection Social Workers means that Derbyshire needs to set out how we intend to become the employer of choice in this region.

Priority 1 – Recruitment

To recruit sufficient permanent high quality staff with suitable qualifications and experience, in 2019 and 2020 we will:

- Improve the clarity of the support and development package for social workers in Derbyshire in the recruitment advert information
- Increase our exposure in the market place through considering social media advertising, professional bodies and other appropriate websites
- Create and develop a Social Worker microsite
- Consider working with a recruitment agency to create a Social Work recruitment campaign
- Run Child Protection Social Work Recruitment Events eg Social Work Live
- Create stronger partnerships with teaching partnerships and other Universities to encourage student placements in Derbyshire in order to create a pool of potential candidates
- Continue with the Step Up, Grow Your Own and Frontline programmes
- Encouraging agency staff to apply for Derbyshire social worker vacancies where appropriate and reduce conversion timescales without compromising the necessary recruitment checks
- Young people will be part of the decision making process in selection processes where ever possible
- Complete an end to end recruitment process review with defined Service Level Agreements and monitoring data, with consideration of centralised recruitment campaigns.

Priority 3 – Reward & Retention

To reward and retain existing Social Workers by ensuring they have the right knowledge, skills and support to carry out their roles successfully, and by ensuring we are a competitive employer within the Social Worker market place we will:

- Provide a quality induction process for new Social Workers
- Provide a clear professional pathway for Social Workers
- Conduct regular supervision
- Provide bespoke professional systemic training
- Seek approval to implement a Market Supplement to Grade 9, 10 and 11 Child Protection Social Workers, including an uplift for Grade 12 Social workers, reviewable after 2 years
- Have appropriate caseloads for experience levels
- Provide flexible working options
- Maintain a culture of reflection and learning on staff feedback
- Provide wellbeing and resilience support through the Council's Wellbeing strategy

Priority 4 – Caseload Management

Sustaining manageable caseloads is key to ensuring good outcomes for children. In addition, it is important that Social Workers feel that their caseloads are manageable in order to help retention. To ensure sustainable levels of caseloads we will:

- Allocate cases based on experience of the worker
- Reduce turnover to provide consistency in casework
- Manage processes to 'step down' cases where appropriate
- Apply a caseload management system to reflect the number of cases allocated and complexity
- Continue to offer regular, reflective good quality supervision

Priority 5 – Continuous Improvement

To ensure that learning is distributed we will:

- Provide Practice Supervisors to support, challenge and coach Social Workers
- Ensure that the auditing processes drive case management improvements within teams
- Use Challenge Days to identify areas for development and share these with teams

Priority 6 – Career Development

To ensure there are clear pathways for career progression and support, we will:

- Continue to offer a robust and supportive ASYE programme for newly qualified social workers
- Continue to offer our Systemic Practice training and development programme
- Continue to offer a varied programme of staff development
- Support social workers progressing through our grade structure
- Develop a Social Work Apprenticeship route into the Derbyshire social work workforce

Quantitative Success Measures

1. Number of Child Protection Social Workers recruited
2. Reduction in Child Protection Social Worker agency numbers
3. Reduction in Child Protection Social Workers turnover rate
4. Reduction in CP SW caseload
5. ASYE completion rates
6. Systemic Practice completion rates
7. Audit and performance outcomes

Qualitative Success Measures

1. Staff feedback including exit interviews
2. Feedback from children, parents and carers
3. Audit outcomes
4. Initial child protection case conference, case reviews and case closure

**Delivering Derbyshire's Children's Services Child Protection Social Workers
Recruitment and Retention Strategy Priorities 2019 - 2020**

Action Plan

Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Status
Grade 10 Child Protection Social Workers start at point 22 - £29,957pa			Completed
Grade 11 Child Protection Social Workers start at point 25 - £33,084pa			Completed
Social Worker Recruitment Project Officer 12mFTC appointed funded from Growth Bid	April 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	Completed
Enhance Grade 9 Social Workers salary to top of Grade 9 Scale £26,890pa	May 2019	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	Completed
Priority 1 – Recruitment			
Increase our exposure in the market place through considering social media advertising, professional bodies and other appropriate websites <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regular sponsored posts on all social media sites including Facebook, Twitter and LinkedIn • all major job board sites including Indeed, Reed, Jobsite and Monster (our competitors all have jobs on these platforms and this is where the majority of candidates will go to look for jobs). • Job posts on relevant social work sites/publications such as BASW and Community Care 	On-going expectation	Social Worker Recruitment Project Officer	Commenced
Create and develop a Social Worker microsite The webpage would set out: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DCC's Child Protection context • Sells Derbyshire as a place to live and work • CPD opportunities • Staff benefits • Case studies of DCC Social Workers • Job vacancies 	October 2019	Social Worker Recruitment Project Officer	

Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Status
Consider working with a recruitment agency to create a Social Work recruitment campaign (this could include work on developing a Microsite for recruitment purposes).	May 2019	Social Worker Recruitment Project Officer	Consideration of appointing an agency for Erewash Locality as a pilot has commenced with some procurement issues needing to be clarified. When appointed an agency would be paid for attracting appointable candidates and/or on appointment.
Run Child Protection Social Work Recruitment Events eg Social Work Live <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DCC's Child Protection context • Sells Derbyshire as a place to live and work • CPD opportunities • Staff benefits • Case studies of DCC Social Workers • Job vacancies 	June 2019	Social Worker Recruitment Project Officer	
Create stronger partnerships with teaching partnerships and other Universities to encourage student placements at Derbyshire in order to create a pool of potential candidates	On-going expectation	Social Worker Recruitment Project Officer	<p>Currently in teaching partnerships with the University of Nottingham, Nottingham Trent and the University of Derby. As part of this partnership, we offer student placements and receive CPD and guest lecturing opportunities in return.</p> <p>Meetings have taken place with the University of Sheffield, Sheffield Hallam, the University of Nottingham, the University of Derby, Manchester Met and the University of Manchester. The aim of the meetings is to discuss and plan the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DCC to provide placements for final year students. • DCC information sessions with SW students re placements and careers at Derbyshire. • University workshops and CPD for our social workers. • Guest Lecturing.

Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Status
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Students completing research at Derbyshire. • Understanding issues within DCC and amending the curriculum to address these. • Attendance at open days and career fairs.
Continue with the Step Up, Grow Your Own and Frontline programmes	On-going expectation	Principal Social Worker	Established
Encourage agency staff to apply for Derbyshire vacancies and student placements where appropriate. To include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identifying those to be approached • Employment marketing workshop fully explaining benefits of employment including: salary, pension provision, annual leave entitlement, flexi-time and other employment benefits • Refining the interview process to include central and localised recruitment • Full recruitment checks • Buddying/mentor programme 	On-going expectation	Heads of Service	Commenced – some agency staff have already converted to DCC employees, process requires refinement
Young people will be part of the decision making process in selection processes	September 2019	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	Already in place for higher level leadership posts. With high numbers of interviews and school commitments of children creativity is needed to enable involvement in more substantial recruitment
Complete an end to end recruitment process review with defined Service Level Agreements and monitoring data, with consideration of centralised recruitment campaigns.	June 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	
Develop a Social Work Apprenticeship route into the Derbyshire social work workforce together with Adult Care	September 2019	Principal Social Worker/HR Business Partner (CS)	Apprenticeship provider procurement process being drafted
Consider joint recruitment activity with Adult Care	June 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	Joint meeting planned June 2019 to partner on SW workforce strategy
Priority 2 Reward & Retention			

Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Status
Implement market supplements to compete with neighbouring Council's in the regional Social Worker employment market.	June 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	Report to CMT 28 May 2019. If approved report to ACOS June 2019.
Consider recruitment and retention payments	May 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	No DCC procedure for recruitment and retention payments in place – option to be considered further at end of market supplement period if approved.
Provide a quality induction process for new Social Workers	On-going expectation	Social Worker Recruitment Project Officer	Current induction process requires refinement and consistent application
Provide a clear professional pathway for Social Workers	On-going expectation	HR Business Partner (CS)/ Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	Established
Conduct regular supervision	On-going expectation	Team Managers of social workers	Well established
Have appropriate caseloads for experience levels	On-going expectation	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	Monitoring process established and swift response by leaders to rising levels as they occur
Provide flexible working options	On-going expectation	Heads of Locality	Established
Maintain a culture of reflection and learning on staff feedback	On-going expectation	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	Established
Provide wellbeing and resilience support through the Council's Wellbeing strategy	June 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	
Work with Adult Care colleagues to align retention and reward strategies	June 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	Joint meeting planned June 2019 to partner on SW workforce strategy
Priority 3 – Caseload Management			
Allocate cases based on experience of the worker	On-going expectation	Heads of Locality	Established
Reducing turnover to provide consistency in casework to 10% by December 2019	On-going expectation	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
Managing processes to 'step down' cases where appropriate	On-going expectation	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	Established
Priority 4 – Continuous Improvement			
Provide Practice Supervisors to support, challenge and coach Social Workers	On-going expectation	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	Established

Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Status
Ensure that the auditing processes drive case management improvements within teams and the Children's Training Team	On-going expectation	Head of Service-Quality Assurance	Development points from Audits is fed into the Early Help And Safeguarding Learning and Development Group
Use Challenge Days to identify areas for development and share these with teams and the Children's Training Team	On-going expectation	Head of Service-Quality Assurance	Established
Priority 5 – Career Development			
Continue to offer our ASYE programme	On-going expectation	Adult Care Learning and Development	Established Monitoring completion rates
Continue to offer our Systemic Practice programme	On-going expectation	Principal Social Worker	Established Monitoring completion rates
Continue to offer a varied programme of staff development defined by the Principal Social Worker	May 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	Programme in place Reviewed through workforce planning process
Work with Adult Care colleagues to provide coherent career pathways in social work	June 2019	HR Business Partner (CS)	Joint meeting planned June 2019 to partner on SW workforce strategy
Support social workers progressing through our grade structure	On-going expectation	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	Established
Monitoring			
Number of Child Protection Social Workers recruited	Every 2 months	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
Reduction in Child Protection Social Worker agency numbers	Every 2 months	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
Reduction in Child Protection Social Workers turnover rate to 10% by December 2019.	Every 2 months	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
Reduction in CP SW caseload	On-going expectation	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
Audit outcomes	Every 2 months	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
ASYE Completion Rates	Every 2 months	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
Systemic Practice Completion Rates	Every 2 months	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
Staff feedback including exit interviews	Every 2 months	Service Director Early	

Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Status
		Help and Safeguarding	
Feedback from children, parents and carers	Every 2 months	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	
Initial child protection case conference, case reviews and case closure	Every 2 months	Service Director Early Help and Safeguarding	